Araştırma Makalesi / Research Article / Article de Recherche

Understanding the Class Based Tastes of Syrian Immigrants via Association Rules Analysis: Example of Gaziantep / Turkey[1]

Mustafa Emre Köksalan
Prof.
Faculty of Communication, Gaziantep University
koksalan@gantep.edu.tr
ORCID: 0000-0003-4977-3437

Bayram Oğuz Aydın
Assoc. Prof. Dr.
Faculty of Communication, Süleyman Demirel University
bayramaydin@sdu.edu.tr
ORCID: 0000-0003-2061-1688

Gökhan Gökgöz
Prof.
Faculty of Communication, Gaziantep University
gokhangokgoz@gantep.edu.tr
ORCID: 0000-0002-9072-4015

Abstract

As a result of Syrian migration to Gaziantep, while locals' and immigrants' tastes and habitus help them to create a better intercultural communication opportunity in their daily lives, they also led them to possible socio-cultural conflicts. Sociologically, tastes and habitus work together in harmony to clarify the distinction between classes which can better unveil the possible conflict and consensus areas. In this study, we aim to describe the association rules of Syrian immigrants' tastes which have been established by their habitus and the class of which they belong to. In conclusion, the associations between class and tastes of immigrants are more particularly

seen in certain taste categories and each class reflects its own categories of association rules of tastes related to their idiocratic class characteristics.

keywords: *taste, distinction, intercultural communication, Syrian immigrants, association rules analyses.*

Résumé

Comprendre les goûts de classe des immigrants syriens via l'analyse des règles d'association : Exemple de Gaziantep / Turquie

Avec la migration syrienne vers Gaziantep, les goûts et les habitus des habitants et des immigrés les aident à créer une meilleure opportunité de communication interculturelle mais aussi ils les conduisent à d'éventuels conflits socio-culturels. Sociologiquement, les goûts et les habitus s'harmonisent pour clarifier la distinction entre les classes qui peut mieux dévoiler les éventuels conflits et zones de consensus. Dans cette étude, nous visons à décrire les règles d'association des goûts des immigrés syriens qui ont été établies par leur habitus et par la classe à laquelle ils appartiennent. En conclusion, les associations entre classes et goûts des immigrés se sont vues plus particulièrement dans certaines catégories de goûts et chaque classe reflète ses propres catégories de règles d'association de goûts liées à leurs caractéristiques de classe idiocratiques.

mots-clés: *goût, distinction, communication interculturelle, immigrants syriens, l'analyse des règles d'association.*

Öz

Suriyeli Göçmenlerin Sınıf Temelli Beğenilerini Birliktelik Kuralları Analizi Aracılığıyla Anlamak: Gaziantep / Türkiye Örneği

Suriyelilerin Gaziantep'e göçü sonucunda yerel halkın ve göçmenlerin beğeni ve alışkanlıkları bir yandan onların gündelik yaşamlarında daha iyi bir kültürlerarası iletişim olanağı yaratmalarına yardımcı olurken, bir yandan da sosyo-kültürel çatışmalara yol açabilmektedir. Toplumsal olarak, beğeni ve "habituslar", olası çatışma ve uzlaşma alanlarını daha iyi ortaya çıkarabilecek sınıflar arasındaki ayrımı netleştirmek için uyum içinde çalışırlar. Bu saptamadan hareketle, bu çalışmada ilgili ayrımı daha iyi açıklamak adına Suriyeli göçmenlerin habitusları ve ait oldukları sınıf tarafından oluşturulan beğenilerinin birliktelik kurallarını betimlemeyi amaçladık. Sonuç olarak, göçmenlerin sınıf ve beğenileri arasındaki ilişkiler daha özel olarak belirli beğeni kategorilerinde görülmektedir ve her sınıf kendine özgü sınıf özelliklerine ilişkin kendi beğeni birliktelik kurallarının kategorilerini yansıtmaktadır.

anahtar kelimeler: *beğeni, ayrım, kültürlerarası iletişim, Suriyeli göçmenler, birliktelik kuralları analizi.*

Introduction

Within the scope of our research project which tries to discover and explain the intercultural communication problem and opportunity patterns of locals and Syrian immigrants[2] living in Gaziantep/Turkey, we have acted from a relational sociological perspective. While exploring the forms and possibilities of conflict and reconciliation brought about by the practical and symbolic encounters of immigrants and locals in different spaces of Gaziantep city; we tried to discuss Bourdieu's (1979, 1984, 2015, 2016) concepts of class, capital and habitus, especially through the positioning of immigrants and locals in the universe of taste, which is partly similar and partly divergent. In our research, we used tastes within the framework of its classifier function, in Bourdieusian sense, in order to clarify intercultural communication patterns of immigrants and locals. For him, taste classifies and the most visible consequence of this distinction is the class itself. Following this approach, one of the crucial findings we reached was that the multi-layered and diverse taste clusters revealed a class distinction in terms of both local and Syrian immigrant society and culture. However, when we examine the tastes for "media-mediated cultural consumption practices" -which are very limitedly mentioned in Bourdieu's works but occupy a very crucial place nowadays- and some culturally specific daily life consumptions, we discovered that the preference for "the popular" represents a significant level and/or form of transition between classes. Popular culture, especially today, is encountered in every aspect of daily life. Nevertheless, when it comes to discussing a socio-economic and even cultural classification and distinction over tastes, popular culture itself and some other class-specific tastes become visible with subtle distinctions both in class and related context. Also, among these classes, what is popular seems to manifest itself in idiocratic forms. So, in this study, we aim to make these "subtle distinctions" more visible with the help of association rules analysis. In order to do this, we ask the following research questions, which are all limited to the case of Syrian immigrants living in Gaziantep:

Research Question 1: What are the associations of taste that conform to and cut across class distinctions?

Research Question 2: Where do popular tastes position themselves in these associations and/or how do they function?

Research Question 3: To what extent and in what forms can association rules analysis describe the class distinctions produced by tastes?

In the following first section, we present a brief theoretical discussion on taste, habitus and their classifying function, by focusing at the end, on their use

---

2   Throughout the article, in order to establish a unity of identification, we refer to asylum seekers, refugees and transit migrants in Gaziantep as immigrants/migrants.

in migration studies. In the second section, we describe our methodology by explaining the association rules analyses as a data mining and analyzing technic and its relationship with our problematic; then in the third section, we focus on our main findings derived from each city region and discuss these findings within the framework that we have previously constructed.

Theoretical Discussion

Taste and Its Classifying Function

Bourdieu explains -in a very detailed and complicated way- his theory on the relationship between class and taste in his famous work "La Distinction (Distinction)". Howewer, as Airoldi (2017, p. 16) underlined, the key thesis of "La Distinction" is that cultural taste "– the taste for the arts as well as for "symbolic goods" in – is simultaneously the (naturalized) social product of class-based socialization and a classificatory device drawing symbolic boundaries (Lamont & Molnar, 2002), ultimately serving to reinforce and reproduce long-lasting social inequalities". Bourdieu himself clarifies the role and definition of taste in his theory as follows:

> "Taste classifies, and it classifies the classifier. Social subjects, classified by their classifications, distinguish themselves by the distinctions they make, between the beautiful and the ugly, the distinguished and the vulgar, in which their position in the objective classifications is expressed or betrayed (Bourdieu, 1984, p. 6)".

Bourdieu uses taste as a cultural distinction by which it will be possible to understand the regular statistical patterns of action as his major agenda of the theory of practice (Swartz, 1997, p. 95). In this sense, the tastes become a sociological tool of understanding what people have through their properties and practices: "… understanding, on the one hand, the conditions in which the products on offer are produced, and on the other hand, the conditions in which the consumers produce themselves (Bourdieu, 2002, p. 166)."

What taste classifies is the "class" itself. In other words, the distinction that emerged as a consequence of the tastes can be considered as classes. Bourdieu (1984) claims that no individual, group or class can be free from the logic of distinction in a divided society. Thus, according to him, the fundamental principle that makes class bring into view is the distinction. The two elements that are found upon the distinction are material and symbolic relations. While material relations, -more formally, objective status positions- limit the attitudes and actions of individuals, symbolic relations (habitus which appears as internal ideas and tastes) rather point to the individual's inner experiences and active construction of the living world.

As Hong and Zhao (2015, p. 4) stated Bourdieu defines the class as a group of individuals who shares a common nature and the same external living conditions. Always referring to taste and its classifying role, Bourdieu clarifies his notion of class by referring to his famous concepts, capital and habitus. He proposes using the notion of capitals (cultural, economic, social and symbolic) in order to analyse "the individuals' external living conditions in the social space" while using habitus to analyse "the internalized personal characteristics (Hong & Zhao, 2015, p. 4)." But considering his major works, during class formation, economic and cultural capitals seem to be considered as the most important forms of capital.

Habitus also seems to have a crucial place here. But the capitals and habitus perpetually work together. As habitus refers to certain codes and/or norms that serve to structure the agent while it is restructured by the agent him/herself, this structuring process seems to be related with the agent's cultural and economic class in Bourdieusian sense (Bourdieu, 2015). Here, the tastes act as a litmus test, indicating under which classes the agents might belong by their choices.

Taste as a function of habitus

As Kwon (2007, p. 57) stated, "Bourdieu's sociological understanding of taste accounts for the relations between habitus and practice". Especially habitus is a key element of Bourdieusian sociology particularly when it comes to explaining the causalities and consequences of dispositions of agents (Lizardo, 2014, p. 341). According to him, consumption is a daily life practice that we witness in agents' daily life choices, such as clothing, music, TV shows, furniture and so on. These practices and tastes are -as a result- considered as a function of habitus.

In Bourdieu's (1980) early works, habitus, which is defined as the attitudes, behaviours, feelings and practices produced by conditionings associated with a certain class of existence condition, later reaches a more relational definition that we will also be followed in this study (Jourdain & Naulin, 2016, p. 42-44). According to this, where the agents are not passive, habitus rather includes the possibility of discovering the role of the active subjects. Thus, Bourdieu (2002, p. 134-135) eliminates the predictability of human behaviour by focusing on the existence of a dimension that also produces habitus:

> "I wanted to insist on the idea that the habitus is something powerfully generative. To put it briefly, the habitus is a product of conditionings which tends to reproduce the objective logic of those conditionings while transforming it. It's a kind of transforming machine that leads us to 'reproduce' the social conditions of our own production, but in a relatively unpredictable way, in such a way that one cannot move simply and mechanically from knowledge of the conditions of production to knowledge of the products".

Habitus is a principle which is produced by history, but it is also a derivational principle detached from history. Bourdieu (2016, p. 162) emphasizes the machine-like characteristic of habitus by referring to a self-correcting computer program. For Bourdieu (2002, p. 87), "it is constituted from a systematic set of simple and partially interchangeable principles, from which an infinity of solutions can be invented, solutions which cannot be directly deduced from its production". Departing from Bourdieu's analogy, we might go further by claiming that habitus works like a kind of artificial intelligence that constantly updates the conditions of objectivity and subjectivity. This artificial intelligence-like characteristic of habitus- can be better understood by following the association rules that emerged in different tastes and class distinctions as we tended to describe in our research.

As O'Reilly (2015) stated, according to Bourdieusian sociology, people's tastes, preferences, passions and actions cannot be independent of structural limitations, but in this process that determines the habitus of individuals, habitus is reproduced every time. Thus, while habitus, which creates references about what the individual does in social life, shapes individuals, on the other hand, the actions of individuals that contain all kinds of possibilities in daily life can bend the habitus. In this case, tastes, mostly the cultural ones and the ones belonging to daily life practices, seem to be valuable tools for understanding the objective logic of the conditionings which have limitless possibilities.

Rethinking Immigrants' habitus and class distinction via Bourdieu: A conceptual overview

The use of Bourdieusian concepts in migration studies is relatively a recent phenomenon. Among these uses, we witness mostly the ones on "cultural, economic and social capital" (Akis-Kalaycıoğlu, 2014, p. 188). In some research, cultural capital seems to be more prominent by offering the fact that migrants "exercise agency by creating new forms of migration-specific cultural capital (Erel, 2010, p. 643)". Here Bourdieusian approaches to migration seem to be positioned in a meso-sociological context where the agent and the structure are equally crucial.

According to Erel (2010, p. 644), this meso-sociological approach is nourished also by the classical "rucksack- approach to cultural capital" in migration studies which "views migrants as bringing with them a package of cultural resources that may or may not fit with the 'culture' of the country of residence". These approaches claim that once the migrants arrive in the country of immigration, they unpack their rucksack in order to see if their resources (cultural capital) fit the cultural hegemony of the host country. On the other hand, the Bourdieusian approach considers migrants' cultural capital as:

> A treasure chest consisting of language skills, knowledge about customs and lifestyles, professional qualifications etc. Again,

these are put in the rucksack, but when unpacked in the country of migration, rather than looking for a 'fit', according to Bourdieusian approaches the migrant engages in bargaining activities with institutions (such as professional bodies, universities) and people (such as employers or managers) about the value of these treasures (Erel, 2010, p. 649).

The main contribution of Bourdieu to the rucksack approach is considering the "belongings" in immigrants' bags as their habitus which will soon confront to the ones of country of the migration. Taste here works usually as a distinction tool or litmus test, which allows us to better understand both locals' and immigrants' social, cultural and even economic positionings (which can also be considered as classes). In this study, we prefer to follow this approach by using the rules of associations in immigrants' tastes. Here, the rules of associations bring into view the complex and barely identified relations in immigrants' choices over tastes which will clarify their cultural and economic capital as well as their class.

Methodology

Association Rules Analysis: A recent tool for data "mining"

In this work, we benefit from the association rules analyses as one of the recent methods of data mining. As a result of the formation of data sets that have accumulated and compiled at an unpredictable rate due to the developing information technologies in recent years, data mining techniques have been used to develop strategies in every field and to support individuals. Data mining is a technique that allows to extract "valuable" information from large-scale data. They provide the opportunity to make future inferences when necessary by revealing the relationships between the data (Alaeddinoğlu et al., 2014). Thus, data mining describes a collection of techniques that aim to find undiscovered patterns within a dataset (Koyuncugil & Özgülbaş, 2010). Today, it seems possible to benefit from data mining methods and techniques in many fields, including medicine and health (Koyuncugil & Özgülbaş, 2010), education (Özdemir et al., 2018) and sociology (Erdal & Papuşcuoğlu, 2021).

Data mining models are basically examined under two headings. The first model is used to predict data whose results are unknown from the patterns that we already have. The second is the descriptive model, which defines the very same data. In predictive models, the model is developed using data whose results are already known. The primary use of this model is to make predictions about result values for data sets whose results are unknown. Descriptive models, on the other hand, enable the identification of patterns in existing data that can be used to guide decision-making. The

similarity of some behaviours of people with certain characteristics can be an example of the descriptive model (Ateş & Karabatak, 2017).

The data mining method consists of sub-sections such as classification, relationship learning (association rules learning) and clustering. Association rules analysis used in this study tries to reveal the rules of which events can occur simultaneously, by measuring the relationship between two or more attributes. In other words, association analysis is the search for association rules that show frequently repeated attribute-valued conditions in a set of data. For instance, regarding buying behaviour, this approach has a wide use in market basket analysis, where the goods that consumers buy together in a shopping process are determined (Oğuzlar, 2004).

When a literature review on tastes is made in the context of the similarity of some behaviours of people with certain characteristics, some studies using the association rules analysis approach are encountered. For example, Lin (2000), in his study based on real data, revealed that association rule mining is quite appropriate in collaborative recommendation systems that suggest articles based on similarities between users' tastes. In another work, Fang et al. (2017) have described and demonstrated how association analysis can be applied in the field of tourism to suggest a personalized smart tour route for tourists according to their tastes and preferences. In this study, we tended to apply these two approaches in clarifying the multidimensional tastes of Syrian immigrants living in Gaziantep, in order to better understand the relationality between taste patterns and classes which we consider as a semiotic/symbolic output of their economic and cultural capital in Bourdieusian sense.

Conceptual Framework, Variables and data mining technics

In order to explain and discuss to what extent and in what form association rules analysis can describe the class distinctions produced by the tastes of Syrian immigrants, we benefit from the data set derived from our terminated research project. The conceptual framework including the variables and subcategories that conceptualize tastes in the preliminary study was compiled from Bourdieu's "Distinction" (2015) which are revised appropriately to the local context (in terms of local social and cultural practices and norms and context) (Table 1).

Table 1. The Conceptual Framework of Tastes

Which of the following are three adjectives that describe the interior you like to live in?	What kind of clothing do you prefer?	When your guests arrive, with what kind of meal do you host them?	What is your main taste of music?	Which of the following genres of books do you mainly prefer?	Which of the following genres of films do you mainly prefer?	If you are watching television, which television program do you prefer?
-Clear, clean -Comfortable -Warm and friendly -Tidy -Easy to clean -Economical, comfortable -Furnished -Classical -Luxury, flashy -Simple, modest	-Classic cut and inexpensive but good quality -Fashionable and suitable for my personality -Simple and neat -Daring and extraordinary - In which I feel comfortable -Elegant and Stylish	-Simple but nicely presented -Appetizing and economical -Naive and attentive -Original and exotic -Hearty and delicious -Traditional food -Whatever God has given	-Arabesque/ fantasy -Blues/Jazz -Hip-hop/Rap -Classic music -Pop music -Rock/Metal Music -Sufi Music -Turkish folk music -Turkish art music	-Detective, adventure -Emotional stories -Travel narratives -Historical narratives -Scientific -Poetry -Politics -Philosophy -Works of classical writers -Works of modern writers -Religious books	-Adventure -Battle -Box office movies -Musical -Comedy -Western -Detective -Historical -Fear -Dramatic -Science fiction -Art cinema	-Documentaries -News -Series -Reality Show -Movies -Art and culture -Entertainment / Show programs -Politics/ discussion -Sport -Religious

In this data set consisting of interior, clothing, hospitality, music, book, movie and TV program tastes of Syrian immigrants residing in Gaziantep, taste associations were determined by using the FP-Growth algorithm through the RapidMiner package program. The crucial issue in association rules is to examine the associations between data at a given time. A priori algorithm is the most common method used to find highly repetitive objects. In this study, the A priori algorithm, which is the most common association rule, and the FP-Growth algorithm, which performs faster than other algorithms, were used together (Kiraz & Deliismail, 2018). In association rules, 3 basic features are used: support, confidence and lift. Support refers -within the scope of our study- to the probability of having the same taste in a case at the same time or to the probability of repeating this association in the same case. Confidence is the probability of seeing one type of taste and another type of taste together. Lift is a value to check the popularity of the tastes. The high probability of having a Y-taste when having an X-taste does not mean that Y-taste is popular. To demonstrate this, lift value between two tastes is needed (Harikumar & Dilipkumar, 2016; Kiraz & Deliismail, 2018).

The Syrian Immigration Case in Gaziantep

Gaziantep as one of the most socio-politically and economically prominent cities of the southeast region of Turkey has become a new home for many Syrian immigrants, since their first arrival in March 2011. By December 2021, 460.690 Syrian immigrants reside in Gaziantep[3] which constitutes one-fourth of the local population of the city. Most of the Syrian immigrant population resides in the former ghettos of Gaziantep (70% approximately) where they have to survive with an income under the minimum wage. The average incomes of the ones residing in wealthier regions are even half of the locals but the difference between the poorest and the wealthiest is significantly high.

The main findings of our study comprise the association rules patterns of the Syrian immigrants' tastes according to the five regions/districts which are considered as socio-economic spaces. In the survey phase of the research, according to Gürbüz and Şahin (2016), the minimum sample size to represent the universe at 99% confidence level was 665 people for Gaziantep residents; It is determined as 661 for Syrians. So, relevant data were collected from a total of 706 participants, between January 2020 and April 2020 -upon the ethical approval provided by the Clinical Research Ethics Committee of the university of which the researchers are affiliated- by determining the sample sizes representing each spatial region (n=706). These regions are described in accordance with the study of Sönmez (2017), which examines the spatial distribution of Syrian refugees in the city of Gaziantep over the current land market values and average housing rents. Thus, in this study, the first region indicates the places where the wealthiest residents live, while the fifth region covers the places of the poorest ones. In order to see more clearly the socio-economic demography of the immigrants, we present gender, level of education, distribution of the sample by regions/districts and income level averages by regions/districts in Table 2.

---

3   See: https://bit.ly/3VnNWZX . Accessed: 30.01.2022.

Table 2. Information on Selected Demographic Variables

Variable		N	%
Gender	Women	345	48,87
	Men	361	51,13
Level of education	None	109	15,46
	Primary School	154	21,84
	Secondary School	175	24,82
	High School	142	20,14
	Associate degree	21	2,98
	Undergraduate	99	14,04
	Graduate	5	0,71
Distribution of the Sample by Regions/ Districts	First Region	104	14,731
	Second Region	110	15,581
	Third Region	176	24,929
	Fourth Region	170	24,079
	Fifth Region	146	20,680
Income Level Averages by Regions/ Districts[4]	First Region	8421,818 TL	
	Second Region	5625,048 TL	
	Third Region	1896,131 TL	
	Fourth Region	1856,306 TL	
	Fifth Region	1941,221 TL	

But particularly in this work, we prefer to present and discuss the four regions (first, second, third and fifth) due to some practical reasons. As we see in Table 2, the last three regions show similar characteristics, especially in terms of economic capital. Here, the third and fifth regions have idiocratic cultural and social aspects but the findings of the fourth region can be negligible in terms of having similar characteristics especially with the fifth region.

Findings and Discussion

The Rules of Association of the Tastes of the Syrians due to the regions

The Rules of Association in the First Region

As we underlined above, the first region mentioned in the table below (Table 3) covers the taste associations derived from the neighbourhoods where the

---

4　The data presented in this table were collected between January and April 2020 and in this period the average TL-Euro currency rate was approximately 1 Euro = 8 Turkish Lira. As of January 2020, the minimum wage in Turkey is 2324 TL.

wealthiest classes (upper-class) of the city of Gaziantep live. Although the Syrian immigrants living here are in the minority in number, they have relatively good living standards in terms of average income and have a higher education level than other immigrants living in the city. When we examine the data and relations (taste-class) presented in the table below, the traces of this class position are clearly seen.

As the first general finding, it is seen that the diversity in the preferences in the part of the premises continues in the conclusion part. However, it is clear that there is a concentration on certain tastes and their associations, indicating the characteristics of the class. Eight of the 15 strong relationships we come across here include pop music, which represents a popular form of taste. On the other hand, the others are mostly related to "media-mediated cultural consumption tastes" and can be evaluated as being closer to the field of popular culture.

Table 3. The Rules of Association of the Tastes of the Syrians
Residing in the First Region
(minimum confidence = 0.55)

Rank	Premises	Conclusion	Support	Confidence	Lift
6	Elegant and Stylish	Pop music	0.125	0,591	1,429
7	clear clean	News	0,087	0,600	1,600
8	Furnished	Soap opera	0,087	0,600	1,733
9	Fashionable, suitable for my personality, Series	Pop music	0,077	0,615	1,488
10	Trendy, suit my personality, Traditional food	Pop music	0,067	0,636	1,539
11	faith-based	News	0,106	0,647	1,725
12	Adventure	Pop music	0,135	0,667	1,612
13	Turkish folk music	News	0,115	0,667	1,778
14	Appetizing and economical	News	0,077	0,667	1,778
15	Appetizing and economical	Fashionable, suitable for my personality	0,077	0,667	1,825
16	Historical narratives	Pop music	0,067	0,700	1,693
17	news, adventure	Pop music	0,067	0,700	1,693
18	Scientific	Pop music	0,115	0,706	1,707
19	emotional stories	Soap opera	0,096	0,714	2,063
20	Classical	Pop music	0,067	0.875	2,116

Departing the data table above some of the main associations can be summarized as follows:

(a) The relationship of taste, which is seen with the highest frequency among the immigrants in the first region, is "elegant and stylish", which defines the preferred clothing style, and "pop music" as the most preferred music genre. Accordingly, among all the variables included in the analysis in this region, the frequency rate of co-occurrence of immigrants who prefer to dress "elegantly and stylishly" and "pop music" is 12.5%. It is seen that 59.1% of the immigrants who prefer to dress "elegantly and stylishly" also have "pop music" tastes (Table 3). The lift value of the same relationship also indicates that the probability of immigrants having both tastes at the same time is significantly higher (Lift=1,429).

(b) Again, as can be seen in Table 3, among the immigrants living in the first region, the majority of those who prefer the "classic" interior style also listen to pop music (87.5%). Even though this relationship is not frequently seen in general associations (0.67%), both the frequency and probability of two tastes being seen together are quite high (Lift=2.116).

(c) Another factor that points to the class position of the immigrants living in this region is the "news" viewing choices, which is frequently encountered in the conclusion statements. Turkish Folk Music taste comes to the fore as an interesting association in premises that prioritize news choices. Accordingly, among the immigrants living in this region, the frequency of listening to Turkish Folk Music and watching TV news is high among all variables (11.5%). It is seen that 66.7% of the immigrants who prefer to listen to "Turkish Folk Music" also prefer to watch the news. Again, the probability of seeing both likes together was found to be higher than the probability of only watching the news (Lift=1,778).

As stated above, pop music seems to have a crucial place in the world of immigrants as a strong, highly repeated taste. As Bourdieu (2015, p. 27) states, music taste is considered as one of the most "legitimate" ways of describing sociologically different classes. In this sense, while the music preferences of individuals are influenced by their cultural and economic capital (educational status, cultural heritage, environment, social class, etc.), on the other hand, these tastes can be read as symbolic indicators of all these capitals. Immigrants living in the first region have the possibility of better integrating into the society in which they settled, due to their relatively high cultural and economic capital. In this sense, the popular music they listen to in Turkish can also be read as an indicator of

positive motivation for living together and of cultural harmony.[5] Another association that shows the relationship between cultural harmony and class is the association between Turkish Folk Music and news watching tastes. Immigrants who understand and/or try to understand Turkish and thus strive to be integrated into the society they live in, seem to reinforce their efforts by watching the news at the same time.

Finally, there are also some variables in association relations in this region that are not seen in other regions. The coexistence of popular music and scientific book-reading tastes is an example of this, and it also points to the association of tastes unique to the upper-class.

The Rules of Association in the Second Region

The second region, whose findings have been presented in Table 4, covers the neighbourhoods in Gaziantep where middle and upper-middle-class immigrants live. Here, as in the first region, the education average is considerably higher than that of the Syrian immigrants throughout the city, while the income level shows a significant decrease compared to the first region.[6] It is possible to evaluate the possibility of this situation revealing class differences through the taste associations in Table 4.

_____

5   One of the most important findings we have obtained in our ongoing research project has been our measurements regarding the acculturation level of immigrants and their tendency to approach or move away from the counterculture. According to this, the region where Syrian immigrants have the highest value of getting closer to the counterculture is the first region (Avg.=3.52). This situation can be considered as immigrants tend to protect their own culture, but also try to understand and recognize the counterculture.

6   The average income of the immigrants residing in the second region is 5625 TL as of 2020. This is equivalent to twice the minimum wage of in the same period. Most of the immigrants residing in this region are high school (42.34%) and university graduates (31.15%).

Table 4. The Rules of Association of the Tastes of the Syrians
Residing in the Second Region
(minimum confidence = 0.55)

Rank	Premises	Conclusion	Support	Confidence	Lift
4	Classic cut, cheap and high quality;	News	0,082	0,600	1,692
5	In which I am comfortable;	News	0,055	0,600	1,692
6	In which I am comfortable;	Traditional food	0,055	0,600	2,129
7	Fashionable, suitable for my personality, warm and sincere;	News	0,055	0,600	1,692
8	Arabesque/fantasy, Classic cut, Cheap and high quality;	News	0,055	0,600	1,692
9	TV Series, Furnished;	Fashionable, suitable for my personality	0,055	0,600	1,692
10	Dramatic;	Traditional food	0,064	0,636	2,258
11	Classic cut, cheap and high quality;	Arabesque/Fantasy	0,091	0,667	1,982
12	Appetizing and economical;	Adventure	0,055	0,667	2,157
13	News, Classic cut, cheap and high quality;	Arabesque/Fantasy	0,055	0,667	1,982
14	Fashionable, suitable for my personality, Furnished;	TV Series	0,055	0,667	2,157
15	News, pop music	Fashionable, suitable for my personality	0,064	0,700	1,974
16	Original and exotic;	Fashionable, suitable for my personality	0,055	0,750	2,115
17	Whatever God has given;	Furnished	0,055	0,750	3,587
18	Adventure, Naive and attentive;	News	0,055	0,750	2,115
19	Original and exotic;	Pop music	0,064	0.875	2,831
20	Engaged	TV Series	0,055	1,000	3,235

The associations of taste in the second region, unlike the first region, seem to reflect quite complex and varied relationships (Table 4). These data may indicate that the second region partly contains different cultural characteristics from the first and partly the third region, and reconstructs them with a habitus that frames its idiocratic class tastes. In this sense, some of the prominent findings are as follows:

(a) The most common taste associations in the second region are between clothing tastes and TV watching choices. In this sense, among all variables, the prevalence of immigrants who prefer

"classic cut and inexpensive (cheap) but high quality" clothes and those who prefer to watch the news on TV is 8.2%. It is also seen that 60% of the immigrants who dress in a classic cut and inexpensive (cheap) but high quality prefer to watch the news the most. The probability of seeing these two tastes together is also significantly higher (lift=1,429).

(b) Among the immigrants living in this region and all variables, the prevalence of immigrants who wear "classic cut and inexpensive (cheap) but high quality" clothes and immigrants who listen to "Arabesque/Fantasy" music is 9.1%. It is also understood that 66.7% of the immigrants who dress in "classical cut and inexpensive (cheap) but high quality" mostly listen to "Arabesque/Fantasy" music. The probability of two tastes being preferred together is significantly higher than just "Arabesque/Fantasy" music preference (lift=1,982).

(c) A remarkable association in terms of the frequency of co-occurrence among all taste relations is between "what God has given" as a choice of hospitality and "furnished" as the preferred interior taste. In this sense, among all variables, the incidence of immigrants who welcome their guests with the "whatever God has given" approach and those who would like to have their interior space to be "furnished" is 5.5%. It is also seen that 70% of the immigrants, who welcome their guests with the preference of "whatever God has given", prefer to reside in a "furnished" house. The probability of choosing two tastes together has the highest ratio among all combinations, according to the preference for only a "furnished" house (lift=3,587).

The association rules in this region indicate that these immigrants, whose financial situation is not as high as in the first region, but whose education level is quite good, prefer - in accordance with social norms- to dress "classic and good but also affordable"; they also watch the news in order to be informed. This relationship can be evaluated as immigrants with two tastes do not give up dressing up well even if they are not very wealthy, and at the same time, as a result of their current awareness level, they have a motivation to be better integrated into their new lives.

It is possible to see the associations of "whatever God has given" as a hospitality preference and "Arabesque/Fantasy" as a musical taste as reflections of an older and traditional habitus that immigrants brought with them and cut across the living space and class. A similar situation is encountered in "whatever God has given", which is a more traditional hospitality preference,

and "furnished" as a more affluent and ostentatious interior preference. While the preference for hosting guests with "whatever God has given" indicates a socio-cultural structure and habitus that cut across classes but defines itself as traditional and conservative, the "well-furnished" taste seems to be closer to the general (again, beyond classes) habitus of the local culture. Therefore, it can be stated that an immigrant individual who prefers "whatever God has given" when hosting guests and wants her/his interior to be "furnished" has a traditional-conservative and local habitus together.

The Rules of Association in the Third Region

The third region covers the neighbourhoods that include the first ghettos of the city and the living areas of the middle-lower class. There is a dramatic decrease in both the economic and the education level in this region, and this situation is likely to reveal a different class structure and habitus.[7] The prominent associations of tastes in this region can be seen below in Table 5.

Table 5. The Rules of Association of the Tastes of the Syrians
Residing in the Third Region
(minimum confidence = 0.55)

Rank	Premises	Conclusion	Support	Confidence	Lift
5	Elegant and stylish	Whatever God has given	0,051	0,6	1,32
6	Turkish folk music;	Whatever God has given	0,057	0,667	1,467
7	Arabesque/Fantasy, comedy	Whatever God has given	0,045	0,667	1,467
8	Arabesque/Fantasy, Comfortable	News	0,057	0,667	1,805
9	Comedy	Arabesque/Fantasy	0,068	0,75	2,031
10	Whatever God has given	Arabesque/Fantasy	0,045	0,889	2,407

The association findings of this region show that there are fewer association relations than all other regions which concentrate on certain variables. The variables that we see the most in the third region focus on music tastes, movie genre preferences and hospitality. It is possible to summarize the prominent relationships in the associations between variables as follows:

---

7   The average income of the immigrants residing in the third region is 1896 TL on average (average 237 Euro) as of 2020. This is approximately 400 TL below the minimum wage of that period. Majority of the immigrants residing in this region are primary school graduates (37.14%). The rate of university graduates among the immigrants residing in the region is only 3.43%.

(a) The strongest association found in the third region is between "whatever God has given" as a preference for hosting guests with dinner, and between "comedy" (as a movie preference) and "Arabesque/fantasy" (as a choice of music listening). Accordingly, the frequency of association between Syrian immigrants who welcome their guests with "whatever God has given" and also prefer to watch "comedy" movies and those who listen to "Arabesque/ fantasy" music is 4.5%. 88.9% of the immigrants who has "what God has given" and "comedy" tastes also listen to "Arabesque/ fantasy" music. The probability of seeing these two taste relations together is extremely high compared to the immigrants' preference for listening to "Arabesque/fantasy" music alone (lift=2,407).

(b) Another finding of association, which shows us that this relationship is extremely strong, occurs when the same variables change places. Accordingly, among all variables, the prevalence of immigrants who listen to "Arabesque/fantasy" music and watch "comedy" movies and those who host their guests with "whatever God has given" is again 4.5%. On the other hand, the probability of co-occurrence of these relationships (confidence=6.67%) and frequency (lift=1,805) is lower than the previous relationship. However, when the two findings of the association are evaluated together, it can be seen that there is a very strong relationship between listening to "Arabesque/fantasy" music and hosting guests with "whatever God has given" preference.

It is meaningful that the "Arabesque/fantasy" music taste manifests itself in almost all associations in the third region, as this is rather the place of people who works in the factories of the organized industrial zone of the city live. This music preference has represented the "voice" of the proletariat working in heavy jobs with low wages in cities since the 1970s (Stokes, 1992, p. 89-108). At the same time, it appears as a "local" cultural element for such immigrants as it musically contains the combination of Turkish folk and art music and Egyptian film music that started to be popular in Turkey in the 1950s. On the other hand, considering that the immigrants residing in this region have a low and/or lower-middle income level, the preference for "whatever God has given", which represents their own means in their choice of hosting guests for dinner can be considered as the main reason for the very strong association of "Arabesque/ fantasy" music preference and "whatever God has given" as a preference for hosting a dinner guest.

The fact that those who prefer to watch "comedy" movies also listen to "Arabesque/fantasy" music can also be evaluated with the class status of immigrants living in this region. Accordingly, it can be expected that these people, who are faced with negative situations and feelings such as financial difficulties and future anxiety, will turn to popular culture products that will

"alleviate" these concerns (Adorno & Horkheimer, 2014). Therefore, comedy genre as a popular taste that cut across classes in general and "Arabesque/Fantasy" as the popular music taste of the working class has the potential to fulfil his function.

The Rules of Association in the Fifth Region

The fifth region includes the poorest neighbourhoods of Gaziantep. Although the class positions of the locals and immigrants living here, which can be described through their economic capital[8], are similar to the fourth region, there are some differences in terms of cultural capital. These regions have been the residence of poor people from the surrounding provinces, especially from the late 1980s to the 2000s. In this sense, the locals here are the immigrants before the Syrians' arrival and Syrian immigrants' settlement choice seems to be affected by the fact that the region is a former ghetto that has a kind of welcoming tradition for the "new ones".

Table 7. The Rules of Association of the Tastes of the Syrians
Residing in the Fifth Region
(minimum confidence = 0.55)

Rank	Premises	Conclusion	Support	Confidence	Lift
11	Traditional food, Warm and friendly	Arabesque/fantasy	0,048	0,636	1,256
12	News, Traditional food	Arabesque/fantasy	0,11	0,727	1,435
13	Whatever God has given, Relax	In which I feel comfortable	0,055	0,727	2,59
14	I am comfortable in, comfortable	Whatever God has given	0,055	0,727	2,042
15	News, in which I feel comfortable	Arabesque/fantasy	0,075	0,733	1,447
16	Arabesque/fantasy, Warm and friendly	Traditional food	0,048	0,778	2,416
17	Series, Classic cut, cheap and high quality	Arabesque/fantasy	0,048	0,778	1,535
18	arabesque/fantasy, Comedy	News	0,068	0,833	2,028
19	News, Comedy	Arabesque/fantasy	0,068	0,833	1,644
20	Arabesque/fantasy, Comfortable	News	0,075	0,846	2,059
21	News, comfortable	Arabesque/fantasy	0,075	0,917	1,809

Findings on the association of tastes in this region show us that immigrants have intense tastes in "Arabesque/fantasy music" along with "news". On the eleven associations indicated in table 7, eight have Arabesque/fantasy

---

8   The average income of immigrants residing in the fifth region is 1941 TL on average (243 Euro on average) as of 2020. This is approximately 350 TL below the minimum wage of that period. The majority of the immigrants residing in this region are those without any diploma (30.4%). Among the immigrants residing in the region, the rate of university graduates is 2.05%.

music tastes, and six have a preference for watching news on TV. After this relationship, the most intense association is seen in the "comfortable" variable with four units. It is possible to describe the prominent ones among these associations as follows:

(a) As we mentioned above, the relationship of taste, which is seen at the highest frequency among the immigrants in the fifth region, is "news" and "arabesque/fantasy". However, especially when considering the premises variables, news is expressed together with another variable in all associations. For example, among all the variables included in the analysis in this region, the rate of co-occurrence of immigrants who prefer to watch "news" and also to host guests with "traditional food" and those who prefer to listen to "Arabesque/Fantasy" is 11%. It is seen that 72.7% of the immigrants who watch "news" and host their guests with "traditional food" also listen to "Arabesque/fantasy" music. The probability of immigrants having both tastes at the same time is significantly higher than the probability of having only one (lift=1,435). Similarly, it has been found that 88.3% of the immigrants living in this region who prefer "news" and "comedy" movies on TV listen to "arabesque/fantasy" music.

(b) Another prominent association in terms of the frequency of co-occurrence of the two taste variables is between the choice of hosting guests for dinner and the choice of interior space and clothing. Accordingly, 72.7% of the immigrants, who welcome their guests with the dinner choice of "whatever God has given" and prefer a "comfortable" interior, also wear the clothes they "are comfortable in". It is also seen that the probability of having both sets of tastes at the same time is quite high compared to those who only prefer the clothes they are comfortable in (lift=2,590).

(c) In the fifth region, another combination of food, interior and music tastes is remarkable. Accordingly, among all associations, the rate of incidence of immigrants who listen to "arabesque/fantasy" music and prefer "warm and friendly interiors" and those who host their guests with "traditional food" is 4.8%. While 77.8% of those who listen to "arabesque/fantasy" music and prefer "warm and friendly" interiors, also host their guests with "traditional food"; The probability of Syrian immigrants having two sets of tastes at the same time is much higher than the probability of having a "traditional food" preference alone (lift=2,416). These immigrants, who are at the bottom in terms of class, can host their guests with "traditional food/whatever God has given" within their means,

The fact that "arabesque/fantasy" music is encountered in many associations in this region shows that among the immigrants living in the region, those with more conservative and traditional tastes prefer to listen to "arabesque/fantasy" music with high frequency and probability. The coexistence of these associations can be considered as compatible with the cultural capital and habitus of those living in this region, since the immigrants here are predominantly religious individuals who come from rural Syria and have the lowest education level among the entire immigrant population. When the low economic capital of immigrants is evaluated together with this situation, the following can be said about their habitus, which gives meaning to their preferences: These immigrants, who are at the bottom in terms of class, can host their guests with "traditional food/whatever God has given" within their means, can only wear clothes that they feel comfortable in, and listen to "arabesque/fantasy" music, which includes their own roots and partially facilitates their bonding with the new culture they live in, while they "prefer" to live in warm and friendly interiors that will "cover/hide their poverty".

In this region, especially in associations related to the "arabesque/fantasy" music taste, one of the frequently encountered tastes is "news". The associations of the news with "arabesque/fantasy" in terms of both frequency and probability; maybe reflecting that the immigrants who have both tastes, on one hand, prefer this type of music in order to escape from problems, reduce their anxieties and not to forget their roots, on the other hand, they have the desire to be aware of the social and environment they live in, and thus to "hold onto life".

Conclusion

Migration is a long-standing phenomenon which is confronted in many parts of the world. The particularity of the Syrian case in Gaziantep is that the flow of immigration has so rapidly grown up and that both populations had to adapt themselves to the new situation so rapidly. In this case, the interactions encountered in every space of the city have given rise to some expectable and/or unpredictable conflicts. In our research in which we generally tended to interrogate the conflicts as well as the opportunities that has emerged throughout these social and cultural, we focused on the distinctions and similarities that can make this possible understanding that the Syrian and Gaziantep society collectively produced. Thus, in order to achieve only one dimension of this understanding, we tried to explain the association rules that Syrian immigrants' tastes characterized due to their class distinctions.

The findings of our study underline that there are obvious relationships between class and tastes of immigrants, consistent with Bourdieu's sociology which affirms that taste classifies people within their economic and cultural capital. In this sense, as a response to our research questions, these associations emerge mainly within two interrelated forms and/or aspects. First, they are more

particularly seen in certain taste categories and associations which cut across im-migrants' class distinctions such as popular music and TV-watching preferences. Secondly, each class reflects its own categories of association rules of tastes related to their idiocratic class characteristics.

The major taste associations which are seen in common are mostly re-grouped under two categories: music taste and TV watching choices. Popular music seems to have a crucial place in the world of immigrants as a strong, highly repeated taste. But what is popular also changed due to the immigrants' habitus, thus class. For instance, while in the first region what is popular is Turk-ish pop music, in the third and five regions the popular music taste turns into "Arabesque/Fantasy" which reflects a taste of the poor, working class and con-servative immigrant identity. Here what clarifies the class distinction over tastes are the association rules established with these music tastes. Among the rela-tively wealthiest immigrants, we see that pop music associates with the "upper class tastes" such as "elegant and stylish, trendy clothing"; "scientific, adven-turous books" and even "classical music." But when it comes to lower class taste preferences and their associations, the popular music of these immigrants associate with the guest hosting tastes which represent a religious, conservative and/or traditional approach such as "Whatever God Has Given". But we have to underline the fact that this particular hosting taste also signifies the economical level of the immigrants as they have nothing to offer to their host, no more than the "God has given" them. All these findings in accordance with taste-class rela-tionship also highlight that, the associations in the first and partly second region represent a "taste of freedom", while the others represent mostly the "tastes of necessity" (Bourdieu, 1996, p. 178).

TV watching choices and the associations established with them follow a similar classifying characteristic. Here TV program taste associations work as a litmus test, through which we can comprehend the immigrants' motivation and/or tendency toward the host culture and society. For example, while the strong association of TV news and Turkish Folk Music tastes in the first region shows the high probability of immigrants existing integration capacity, the association of news with Arabesque/Fantasy music in the fifth region can be read as tendency toward the host culture and habitus without renouncing their own.

Within the limitations of this research, the association rules analysis as a data mining methodology seems to be relevant in identifying and associating the immigrants' taste clusters with their class (economic and cultural capital) and habitus. More clearly saying, with the help of the association rules analyses we can better describe (and/or understand) of immigrants' habitus internalized and/or emerged as cultural tastes, such as; clothing, gastronomy, furniture choices and diverse media consumptions (from literature to music, from TV watching to social media use). This opportunity of using this analysis in migration related studies/researches can have some significant outputs. First, this enables a kind

of "habitus mapping of immigrants" which might be quite useful for discussing the policies for immigrants' integration, social cohesion and/or communication opportunities more profoundly. In other words, by mapping the habitus of immigrants, we might describe leading or highlighted cultural associations which can maximize the opportunities of "living together", especially if this data is compared with the ones of the locals. Further studies can consider these problematics and approaches.

This article has been scanned by plagiarism detection softwares. No plagiarism detected.

Ethics Committee Permission

Author Contribution Statement

Funding

Declaration of Conflicting Interest

No potential conflict of interest was reported by the author(s).

References

Airoldi M. (2017). Digital Distinction Studying Musical Taste Through Digital Methods. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Phd Program in Sociology and Methodology of Social Research, Università Degli Studi di Milano And Università Degli Studi di Torino.

Akis-Kalaycıoğlu, Y. (2014) Uluslararası Göç Bağlamında Bourdieu'nun Kavramları: Ankara'da Yaşayan İranlılar Örneği, İdealkent, Sayı 14, Ekim 2014, pp. 182-205.

Alaeddinoğlu, M., Aydin, T., & Dal, D. (2014). Birliktelik Kuralları İle Mekânsal-Zamansal Veri Madenciliği. Erzincan University Journal of Science and Technology, 5(2), 191-212.

Ateş, Y., & Karabatak, M. (2017). Nicel Birliktelik Kuralları İçin Çoklu Minimum Destek Değeri. Fırat Üniversitesi Mühendislik Bilimleri Dergisi, 29(2), 57-65.

Bourdieu, P. (1979). La Distinction: Critique Sociale de Jugement de Gout, Paris: Les Edition de Minuit: Collection Le sens commun.

Bourdieu, P. (1980). Le Sens pratique, Paris: Les Edition de Minuit: Collection Le sens commun.

Bourdieu, P. (1984). Questions de Sociology, Paris: Les Edition de Minuit: Collection Le sens commun.

Bourdieu, P. (1984). Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgment of Taste. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Bourdieu, P. (1995). Pratik Nedenler: Eylem Kuramı Üzerine (Hülya Tufan, Çev.), İstanbul: Kesit Yayıncılık.

Bourdieu, P. (1996). Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgment of Taste. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Bourdieu P. (2002). Question de Sociologie, Paris: Les Editions de Minuit

Bourdieu P (2002). Sociology in Question, London: Sage.

Bourdieu, P. (2015). Ayrım: Beğeni Yargısının Toplumsal Eleştirisi, Ankara: Heretik

Bourdieu, P. (2016). La Distinction: Critique Sociale de Jugement, Paris: Les Edition de Minuit: Collection Le sens commun (édition électronique)

Bourdieu P (2016). Sosyoloji Meseleleri, Ankara: Heretik

Erdal, E., and Papuşcuoğlu, T. (2021). Yeni Çağın Hammaddesi Veri Madenciliğinin Sosyolojik Açıdan Değerlendirilmesi. Medeniyet ve Toplum Dergisi, 5(1), 66-75.

Erel, U. (2010). Migrating cultural capital: Bourdieu in migration studies. Sociology, 44(4), 642-660.

Fang, H., Chen, C., Lin, J., Liu, X., & Fang, D. (2017). Association Rule Analysis for Tour Route Recommendation and Application to Wctsnop. ISPRS - International Archives of the Photogrammetry, Remote Sensing and Spatial Information Sciences, 42W7, 1121-1126. https://doi.org/10.5194/isprs-archives-XLII-2-W7-1121-2017

Harikumar, S., and Dilipkumar, D. U. (2016). Apriori algorithm for association rule mining in high dimensional data. 2016 International Conference on Data Science and Engineering (ICDSE), 1-6. https://doi.org/10.1109/ICDSE.2016.7823952

Hong Y. and Zhao Y. (2015) From Capital to Habitus: Class Differentiation of Family Educational Patterns In Urban China. The Journal of Chinese Sociology, Springer Open Journal, (2:18).

Kiraz, A., and Deliismail, İ. (2018). İnternetten Yapılan Alışverişlerin Veri Madenciliği Teknikleri ile Analizi ve Depo Süreçlerinin İyileştirilmesi. Bayburt Üniversitesi Fen Bilimleri Dergisi, 1(1), 28-41.

Koyuncugil, A., and Özgülbaş, N. (2010). Veri Madenciliği: Tıp ve Sağlık Hizmetlerinde Kullanımı ve Uygulamaları. Bilişim Teknolojileri Dergisi, 2(2).

Kwon, Y. J. (2007) "Taste in appearance: self, cultivated dispositions, and cultural capital" (2007). Unpublished retrospective theses and dissertations.15977, Doctor of Philosophy; Major: Textiles and Clothin.

Lin, W. (2000). Association Rule Mining for Collaborative Recommender Systems. Undefined. Unpublished Master Thesis, Worcester Polytechnic Institute.

Lamont, M., and Molnár, V. (2002). The Study of Boundaries in the Social Sciences. Annual Review of Sociology, 28 (1965), 167–195

Lizardo, O. (2014) Taste and the Logic of Practice in Distinction. Sociologick asopis/Czech Sociological Review, Vol. 50, No. 3: 335–364.

Oğuzlar, A. (2004). Veri Madenciliğinde Birliktelik Kuralları. Öneri Dergisi, 6(22), 315-321. https://doi.org/10.14783/maruoneri.678958.

O'Reilly, K., (2015). Migration theories: a critical overview. Triandafyllidou, A. (ed.) Routledge Handbook of Immigration and Refugee Studies, Abingdon, Oxford: Routledge, 25-33.

Özdemir, A., Saylam, R., and Bilen, B. B. (2018). Eğitim Sisteminde Veri Madenciliği Uygulamaları Ve Farkındalık Üzerine Bir Durum Çalışması. Atatürk Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi, 22(Özel Sayı 2), 2159-2172.

Stokes, M. (1992) The Arabesk Debate: Music and Musicians in Modern Turkey. Oxford: Clarendon Press

Swartz, D. (1997) Culture and Power. The Sociology of Pierre Bourdieu. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press