

## The connection between Abraham and Hades's bosom in the context of the last judgment scene

Sinan Yılmaz <sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Art History, Byzantine Art, Elazığ/Türkiye.

### ABSTRACT

One of the most important topics of Christianity is the Last Judgment. The Byzantines, as a Christian society, showed great interest in this subject and produced many pieces of art depicting it. The scene consists of several themes coming together. Among the most crucial themes of the scene is Abraham and Hades's Bosom. Using these themes, the artists have kept the event alive in the minds of people about what will happen in the afterlife. While Abraham's Bosom is depicted to the right of Jesus as the area where those who find salvation are located, Hades's Bosom is located on his left side and those, who will face their punishment are seen there. These artists depicted the scenes in connection with each other. However, there is a significant difference here. Whilst Abraham's Bosom is an intermediate form for those who will attain salvation, Hades's Bosom has been part of eternal fire. To make the picture more dramatic and remarkable, the artists depicted the lake of fire with the dragon of Hades swallowing the dead. Thus, the viewer can clearly see what kind of suffering human beings will face in the afterlife. The artists also created a contrast between the two themes by using many permeable structures and transferred this to the paintings.

### KEYWORDS

Death, the last judgment, Abraham's bosom, Hades's bosom.

## Son yargı sahnesi bağlamında İbrahim ve Hades'in kucağı arasındaki bağlantı

### ÖZET

Hıristiyanlığın en önemli konularından biri Son Yargı'dır. Hıristiyan bir toplum olan Bizanslılar bu konu ile ilgili oldukça ilgilenmiş ve sanatlarında birçok resim üretmişlerdir. Bu sahne birkaç temanın bir araya gelmesiyle oluşmaktadır. Sahnenin en önemli temaları arasında İbrahim ve Hades'in Kucağı gelmektedir. Sanatçılar bu temaları kullanarak ölümden sonraki yaşamda nelerin yaşanacağı durumla alakalı insanların zihinlerinde olayı yaşatmışlardır. İbrahim'in Kucağı İsa'nın sağında kurtuluşa ereceklerin yer aldığı alan olarak tasvir edilirken, onun solunda bulunan Hades'in Kucağı zulüm göreceklerin alanı olmuştur. Sanatçılar sahneleri birbiriyle bağlantılı şekilde betimlemişlerdir. Ancak burada önemli bir fark dikkati çekmektedir. İbrahim'in Kucağı kurtuluşa erecekler için bir ara form niteliği taşıırken, Hades'in Kucağı sonsuz ateşin bulunduğu bölüm olmuştur. Resmi daha dramatik ve dikkat çekici yapmak için resme ateş gölünü, Hades'in ölüleri yutan ejderhasını koymuşlardır. Böylelikle izleyici artık ölümden sonra insanoğlunun ne gibi bir acıyla karşılaşacağını net bir şekilde görmektedir. Sanatçılar iki tema arasında birçok geçirgen yapıyı kullanarak bir zıtlık yaratmış ve bunu resimlere aktarmışlardır.

### ANAHTAR KELİMELER

Ölüm, son yargı, İbrahim'in kucağı, Hades'in kucağı.

## Introduction

The concept of Heaven and Hell is mentioned many times in the Old and New Testaments. Although it has accepted Heaven and Hell, the Eastern Orthodox Church generally lacks a clearly defined, official doctrine about Heaven and Hell. In this regard, these concepts have been shaped within the framework of the theological views of early saints and the Church Fathers. It is possible to formulate this as follows. The notions of Heaven and Hell have been shaped within the framework of the theological views of early theologians, known as the Church Fathers. According to Orthodoxy, God is everywhere and fills everything. It is stated that those who love God will live in pleasure and delight, while those who disobey him will burn in eternal fire. The grinding of teeth at Matthew 25:30 is a brief description of what the grind is like here. Heaven and Hell will exist until the day of the Last Judgement. When the time of the Last Judgment comes, Jesus will return to judge the dead.

One of the most expressive examples of the understanding of the afterlife in Byzantine Art is the Last Judgment. The scene is also referred to as the Second Coming of Jesus, and "τελευταία κρίση" in Greek. According to Christian theology, Jesus will return to earth and judge all humanity. Apocalyptic texts, the Old and New Testaments, various sermons, and the writings of theologians have influenced the formation of this idea. The scene of the Last Judgement started to appear in visual art in the 9th century.

Among the most important of the Last Judgment scene is Abraham and Hades's Bosom. While the two themes are handled within the Last Judgment scene, they are portrayed almost very similarly. The permeability of the figures inside the themes is quite evident. In the Last Judgment scene, Abraham's Bosom is located on the right of Jesus, where those destined for salvation, whilst Hades's Bosom is accommodated to his left. While explaining the subject, descriptions of the themes were made, the pictures were interpreted and the connection between the two scenes has been discussed in the present study<sup>1</sup>.

## Last judgment scene

The Last Judgment scene is not based on a single theme. In Eastern Orthodox eschatology, there is an intermediate stage between the death of the body and the final decision regarding the reunion of the soul with the body. In this intermediary stage, the soul is located in Heaven or Hell. Although the Eastern church has never fully defined this perception, this occurs in liturgical practices (Meyer, 2016, p. 76). At this point, the Last Judgment scene represents three main doctrinal themes<sup>2</sup>. The plot is also in the form of synthesis with numerous scenes and figures containing scenes from various chapters of the Old and New Testament (Caridad, 2017, p. 42).

The most basic structure in the formation of the Last Judgment scenes is the separation of sheep and goats<sup>3</sup>. The pictures are proportional to the biblical texts (Matthew, 25: 31-46). One of the earliest examples of the subject is a marble sarcophagus fragment dated from the Early Christian Period (Figure 1) (Herrmann and Van Den Hoek, 2009, p. 35). Jesus sits on a throne in the middle, with sheep on his right and goats on his left. Jesus is indifferent to the goats on the left, and his head is turned to the right. While stroking the sheep's head with his right hand, he gestures to the goats with his left hand to stop them. In this regard, the image of the apocalypse began to increase in the 5th-6th centuries (Kartsonis, 1986, p. 21-22).

<sup>1</sup> There are many examples of the Last Judgment scenes. The examples we have discussed are important because they show the entire composition in one area. For example, in wall paintings, these themes are scattered in different parts of the area. However, the general understanding is similar.

<sup>2</sup> These three main themes are Divine Court, Heaven and Hell.

<sup>3</sup> The separation of sheep and goats stems from the life of Jesus. Because Jesus is described as the Passover sacrifice and the sacrificial sheep that came for humanity in Christianity. The sheep represented the good at this point (Wortley, 2001, p. 60).



**Figure 1** Separation of sheep and goats, marble sarcophagus, late 3th century early 4th century, Rome (Herrmann and Van Den Hoek 2009, p. 35).

Another early example is the painting of the separation of sheep and goats can be found in S. Apollinare in Nuovo (6th century) (Jensen, 2000, p. 160). With Jesus in the middle, there are sheep on his right and goats on his left. With angels present on both sides, here, Jesus is pointing to the sheep with his right hand (Figure 2).



**Figure 2** Separation of sheep and goats, 6th century, S. Apollinare in Nuova, Rome (Morgan, 2019, p. 6).

The process that started with the separating of the Sheep and Goats has continued with various scenes. Kaiser Friedrich Museum host one of preliminary examples of the Last Judgment scenes. The scene which depicts angels blowing trumpet on both sides of the wooden depiction of Jesus on the mosaic panel in the Kaiser Friedrich Museum is among the preliminary examples of the Last Judgment scenes (Peker, 2008, p. 22). In addition, Jesus sitting on the throne and the Judge Apostles on both sides of the Barberini plate dated to the 4th century in the Dumbarton Oaks collection are other examples of the formation of the Last Judgment scene (Brown, 2017, p. 123). Apart from this, the depictions of the emperor and the ruling class accompanying him during the Christian era are another structure that contributes formally to the Jesus and the Judge Apostles template (Peker, 2008, p. 22).

By the 9th century, the Last Judgment composition began to emerge in traditional Byzantine art. At the center of the composition, in the Divine Court, Jesus is depicted seated on the throne, surrounded by many angels. Mary and John the Baptist are shown on his right and left, respectively (*Deesis*). While Jesus is making a sign of blessing with one hand, the other hand is holding a Bible on his chest. The Twelve Apostles are depicted beside him. Beneath the apostles is the other group of saints and the righteous, the sinners on the left. Angels blowing into the trumpet appear in different parts of stage<sup>4</sup>. The Chosen and Angels are grouped as a choir in Byzantine iconography<sup>5</sup>. The scene depicts the sea and the land giving up their dead<sup>6</sup>. In scenes where the lands and seas leave the deads, some people are carried away by angels while others are cursed (Revelation, 20: 12-45). Various of Hell are depicted in the lower part of the scene (Matthew, 22: 13; Mark, 9: 44-45). Paradise is symbolized as a bright area with green vegetation and beautiful birds. The Paradise Garden is surrounded by Mary, Abraham, Isaac and Jacob<sup>7</sup>. Andre Grabar likens this scheme to the Roman protocol of holding a judicial trial. Here he describes Jesus as the last judge of the court (Grabar, 1968, p. 44). Meyer argues that the Last Judgment scene is a collection of items influenced by various works of art. It focuses on the

<sup>4</sup> The angels blowing to trumpet in the scene vary in terms of their locations. For example, sometimes it was located just below the Divine Court, and sometimes it was situated within it. Sometimes it has made a place for itself in a different field.

<sup>5</sup> In the context of the Last Judgment scenes, the Angels or the Chosen are handled as a group. It is clear that the stage has a universal quality in terms of the concept it put forward. This understanding of universality is an important step in their portrayal as a group (Chookaszian, 2011, p. 296).

<sup>6</sup> Like the angels blowing to trumpet, the scene of the Vomiting of the Dead of the Lands and Seas was exhibited in different areas on the stage within the general scheme.

<sup>7</sup> The Paradise Garden shows differences in itself. Sometimes Isaac and Jacob do not enter this area, which varies between regions (Cavarnos, 1993, p. 97-98; Chookaszian, 2011, p. 287; Mouriki, 1976, p. 148; Angheben, 2002, p. 106).

textual sources of the eschatological approach in the paintings and their relationship with the ritual (Meyer, 2016, p. 71).

## Abraham's bosom

One of the three themes in the Paradise Garden in the Last Judgment scenes is Abraham's Bosom. In the scenes, Abraham, sitting on a throne, is depicted holding Lazarus, who appears as a child. At this point, Ephraim emphasizes that Heaven, where Lazarus is located, only hosts the dead resurrected and that Heaven has not yet been realized, therefore the dead are in Abraham's Bosom (Angheben, 2002, p. 115-116; Angheben, 2015, p. 105). Athos monk Nikephoros brought about a different thought in 1277<sup>8</sup>. In his opinion, God sealed the righteous in Abraham's Bosom and the sinners in hellfire (Marinis, 2017, p. 75-76). Abraham's Bosom, reflected in the works, is an intermediate form, especially for the Weighing of Souls. This belief has taken its place in the Christian faith as a middle phase before souls move into their final place in the afterlife. In the Last Judgment scenes, Abraham's Bosom is taken together with the Paradise Garden, and it is separated from the realm of Heaven where the chosen ones reside.

Jerusalem in Heaven, the final destination for those destined for salvation, is explained in Revelation 21: 9; 22: 5. But the Byzantines did not produce a definitive iconographic type for it. While kingship is presented as a social phenomenon in Revelation, Abraham's Bosom appears as a personal experience with which the audience can identify. When Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob united in the Last Judgment scenes, the indicator of the kingdom's power was tried to be revealed (Matthew 8: 11). Another striking element in the Last Judgment paintings are depictions of children. The presence of children around the Prophets is shown by Lazarus in Byzantine Art. The spirits of the departed are depicted as young children in these paintings, because of the association of children with the concept of innocence. Hence, by depicting spirits as children, Byzantine artists were trying to emphasize their purity. Byzantine artists associated young children with the innocence of the soul<sup>9</sup>.

The presence of the New Testament characters in Heaven has taken from the tradition which traces its roots to the Old Testament. The Gospel of Matthew mentions that after the resurrection, many righteous bodies entered the city of Jerusalem (27:52-53). In Apocalypse of Paul, the prophets and their ancestors have already been placed in Paradise. At this point, the prominent Assyrian theologian of the era, Musa Bar Kepha, refers to the existence of Elijah and Enoch in Heaven<sup>10</sup>. These revelation texts show that the righteous were resurrected and taken from Hell before they entered Heaven (Angheben, 2002, p. 115-116).

The transfer of Abraham's Bosom and the rich man to the Last Judgment scene enabled the composition to be expanded. For example, Laurent Plut.VI 23 fol.144r shows the delicate balance of the composition (Figure 3). The scene's division into two parts describes a new state of existence after the second coming of Jesus. In this regard, the relationship seen in the gestures between the rich man and Abraham became more different in the Last Judgment scenes. In the depictions of the Last Judgment scenes, Jesus is completely indifferent towards the rich man. As Marinis notes, in the Sinai icon, Jesus turns his attention to the right, away from the rich man's direction. Therefore, in the context of the Last Judgment, Abraham's Bosom

<sup>8</sup> He was an Athos monk who lived in 1277. Hesikaist is also called Nikephoros. According to Gregorios Palamas, Nikephoros was originally a Roman Catholic. He usually has writings on vigilance. He explains that while describing wakefulness, it is necessary to knead the mind in the heart, and that prayer is a breathing therapy. See for Nikephoros and his views on Hesikaism. Meyendorff, J. (1974). *St. Gregory Palamas and Orthodox Spirituality*. (Translated by A. Fiske). New York: St Vladimir's Seminary Press.

<sup>9</sup> Angheben states that apart from Mary and the Good Thief, the children accompanying Abraham are the only human owners of Heaven (Angheben, 2002, p. 116).

<sup>10</sup> Musa Bar Kepha or Musa Bar Kephah lived in 803-913. He is a Syriac writer who was born in Iraq (Bailey, 2003, p. 190).

displays a transitional image. Abraham is always inevitably clothed and surrounded by the souls of the redeemed (Marinis, 2017, p. 70-72).



**Figure 3** Lazarus in Abraham's bosom and rich man in Hades, Laurent Plut VI. 23, fol. 144r, 11th century (Marinis, 2017, p. 72).

It is Abraham's Bosom that the Byzantines transformed into the image of a universal Paradise. The best example of this can be seen in the story of the rich man and Lazarus (Luke 16: 19-31).

One of the examples of the story appears in Theodore Psalter fol.24v (Figure 4).



**Figure 4** Abraham's bosom, Theodore Psalter, 1066, London Add. 19352 (Marinis, 2017, p. 68).

Abraham is seated on a throne and Lazarus is depicted as a child. Here, Abraham is pointing with his left hand at a large tree with red fruit. On the other side of the tree is the personification of a river. The picture accords with Psalms 22 (23): 2. The green color associated with nature has an important place in Byzantine life and the creation story. Just like the fire behind the rich man, the green field behind Abraham constitutes the theme. In Paris gr. 74 fol. 145v, the spirit of Lazarus appears in Abraham's Bosom with a depiction of exotic trees around it. On the other hand, the naked rich man is placed in the middle of the fire, and the vitality of Heaven is tried to be increased. Another point worth noting is the

presence of the empty throne between Abraham and the rich man. Marinis says that the throne symbolizes God's mystical presence in Heaven and emphasizes the transience of this world (Marinis, 2017, p. 68-69).

Funeral rites show a very coherent understanding of Abraham's Bosom. These religious understandings play an important role in determining the place that helps to separate the souls. Sometimes Isaac and Jacob are also associated with this role (Angheben, 2002, p. 116).

## Hades's bosom

In iconography, a demon often appears in the lake of fire and works from later periods are sometimes named Belzebuth. But in the inscriptions, he's called Hades<sup>11</sup>. Hades appears as the personification of Hell in classical writings and later works. Hades, in the lake of fire, is depicted as a man riding a beast without wings. However, demons and fallen angels are winged. The identity of the beast in the scenes is uncertain. On the other hand, the long-haired and bearded Hades figure we see in pagan hymns is very close to the descriptions depicted here. As with many elements from the Greek tradition, Hades remained a part of the practice of Byzantine iconography and underwent various changes over the centuries (Nilsson, 2018, p. 322). In personified depictions of Hades, he is usually depicted as having a large, sturdy body, a bald

<sup>11</sup> Many names are used for evil beings in Byzantine Art. These include Satan, Belzebuth, the demon, and Hades. While explaining the scenes, it was deemed appropriate to say Hades under this title.



head (sometimes with hair on the sides), and a beard. In all Byzantine portraits, Hades is shown nude or with a loincloth. Maguire attributes this to the Hymns of Romanos the Melodist (Maguire, 2018, p. 311-312)<sup>12</sup>. For example, this is reflected in the 10th century Chludov Psalter fol.8v. Hades is sitting and pulling a figure towards himself (Figure 5).

**Figure 5** Hades holds the souls of sinners, Chludov Psalter, fol. 8v, 9th century (Marinis, 2017, p. 64).

Similarly, in the Bristol Psalter fol. 18r 11th century, Hades was not made as vivid as in Chludov Psalter. It emerges from a dark cave, very akin to Dionysiou 65 (Figure 6). Hades is also sometimes present in the depictions of the Resurrection of Lazarus. In Theodore Psalter fol. 31v, the spirit

of Lazarus flees Hades with a beam of light to Jesus. Hades is holding the spirits standing in his bosom here (Figure 7).



**Figure 6** Hades holding sinful souls, Bristol Psalter, fol. 18r, 11th century, London Add. 40731 (Marinis, 2017, p. 64).



The images depicted in the paintings, especially Hades's Bosom swallowing the dead and devouring everything, are suitable for textual descriptions. In addition, Byzantine artists tried to portray Hades not only as a souls swallower but also as a place that holds souls tightly (Marinis, 2017, p. 63-64).

**Figure 7** The Resurrection of Lazarus and Hades, Theodore Psalter, fol. 31v, 1066, London Add. 40731 (Marinis, 2017, p. 64).

A similar example is the spirit released from Hades at Walters Art Gallery in Baltimore. In the painting, Hades holds the spirit tightly, and then releases it (Figure 8) (Vikan, 1973, p. 122-123).



The visualizations of Hades in Byzantine Art reflect the diversity of textual explanations. These images come from various sources, and the only element that unites the texts and images is the horror of Hades. The purpose here is to convey that Hades became a menacing pagan figure, willing to bind souls with his bosom (Marinis, 2017, p. 65-66).

**Figure 8** Paul of Thebes on the right, the spirit released from Hades on the left, 14th century, Baltimore Walters Art Gallery cod. W733, fol. 69v (Vikan, 1973, p. 122).

Depictions of Hades in a dark cave have a long tradition in Byzantine Art, and it has become a part of the Last Judgment scenes in the eschatological scheme. This personification is often combined with a dragon to emphasize the image of Hell. A striking point in the Last Judgment scenes is the presence of a child figure in Hades's Bosom, similar to Abraham's Bosom. In the Last Judgment scenes, Hades is depicted on top of a beast swallowing people and holding a child in his arms. The identity of this child is unknown (Angheben 2002, p. 106).

<sup>12</sup> Kontakia of Romanos Melodist contains information on the nudity of Hades (On the Resurrection II, O. 25, Strophe 12) (Romanos Melodist, 1970, p. 267).

## Abraham and Hades's bosom in the last judgment scenes



In Byzantine Art, artists connected Abraham and Hades's Bosom. Depictions of Abraham's Bosom and the rich man in the Last Judgment began to enter the scene in 10-11th centuries (Brenk, 1966, p. 101-102). In Paris gr.74, Abraham and Mary are depicted sitting on a throne in the Paradise Garden (Figure 9).

**Figure 9** *The Last Judgment, Paris gr. 74 fols. 51v, second half of the 11th century (Marinis, 2017, p. 55).*

Paradise is described as having many trees and green vegetation. Abraham holds Lazarus, portrayed as a child, in his bosom. On his right and left, three groups of souls made in the form of children draw attention. Just to the left of the Mary is the gate of Heaven with a Cherub in red. St. Peter and other figures are seen in front of this Paradise gate. He leads them, pointing to the gate of Paradise. In the same painting, the

artists depicted the resting place we see in Abraham's Bosom in the lake of fire. A figure is placed in Hades's Bosom, designed as the place of eternal Hell. Here, Hades appears as a beast in the lake of fire, with an unidentified figure on his bosom. The beast and Hades are heading to their right. Two angels are depicted pushing sinners. It reveals the horror of the sinful event in the mouth of the beast.



Similarly, there are depictions of the Paradise Garden on two icons in the Sinai (Figure 10).

**Figure 10:** *The Last Judgment, St. Catherine's Monastery Sinai icon no. 151, 11th century, Egypt (Weitzmann, 1971, p. 304).*

But it especially has a different application at no. 151. While Abraham occupies the lower part of the two-storied Paradise Garden, Mary draws attention to the upper floor. Abraham, sitting on a throne, is holding Lazarus in his arms. Two spirits depicted as children are seen on its left and three on its right. At the top, we see Mary, the Good Thief and two angels. Mary is sitting on a throne here. This is an area whose entrance is blocked by Cherub. The door is painted red as in the other examples. In front of the gate of Heaven, St. Peter brings three figures towards Heaven. The most crucial detail of the figures here is that they are different from the figures coming to the gate of Heaven. Because the figures are separated from the others by the episcopal robes they wear. The rich man is in the red area in the lower part of Hell on the opposite side of the stage.



**Figure 11** *The Last Judgment, St. Catherine's Monastery Sinai icon no. 151, 11th century, Egypt (Meyer, 2016, p. 73).*

Thus, the integrity of the composition was created with both Abraham's Bosom and the rich man. The Chosen go towards the gate where the vegetation and especially the Heaven guarded by an angel are depicted. Details of Hades's Bosom are also found in Sinai icons. In this respect, no. 151 is more similar to Paris gr. 74. Here, the number of figures is reduced to two. However, in no.150, the number of sinners coming towards Hades is increased considerably and some sinners are depicted with their heads (Figure 11).



A similar composition scheme appears in the Torcello wall mosaic (Figure 12).

**Figure 12** *The Last Judgment, Cathedral of S. Maria Assunta, Torcello mosaic, 11-12th centuries, Italy (Marinis, 2017, p. 56).*

However, there are some differences. There is no throne where Mary sits. She is shown praying in a standing position (*orans*). While Abraham is holding Lazarus, who is depicted as a child, in his bosom, other spirits are described on his right and left. The Good Thief is included in this scene. The Good Thief is depicted in a loincloth with his cross in hand. The gate of Heaven is given with a Cherub. St. Peter is moving towards this door. In the painting, the figures he led have disappeared and been replaced by an angel. The ground is similarly painted green to explain the paradise area.



**Figure 13:** *The Last Judgment, Italo-Byzantine ivory, Victoria & Albert Museum, 11th century (Morgan, 2019, p. 9).*

In Torcello, while Abraham is dressed, two groups of children are wearing short tunics on either side. Two children's bands are added to the original theme to emphasize the Chosen. In addition, a hierarchy is striking in the Sinai icon no. 151 while Abraham and Mary are in

the same position in the Paradise Garden in Torcello, Italo-Byzantine ivory, and Paris gr. 74. Here, the Paradise Garden is divided into two floors, with the Virgin Mary at the top and Abraham at the bottom. The Good Thief and the presence of angels appear in Mary's position. This is the clearest indication of the importance of the Good Thief in the Sinai icon in the hierarchical order. Italo-Byzantine ivory is also similar to Torcello (Figure 13).

However, some features differ from these scenes. Abraham and Mary are sitting on a throne, Abraham holding Lazarus, depicted as a child, in his arms. Like Torcello, the Good Thief has entered the Paradise Garden. The Good Thief is depicted with his cross in his hand and his loincloth. Next to him, an angel guides the figures to the Paradise Garden. The Paradise Garden is decorated with various trees. In the Paradise Garden, with Abraham and Mary sitting on a throne, the depiction of the Good Thief and the angel is similar to Torcello.

The most crucial detail in this scene is the absence of the gate of Heaven in the background. In the painting, the leadership passes to the angel instead of St. Peter. The Torcello wall mosaic and the ivory artifact in London provide more detailed personified depictions of Hades. In the Torcello mosaic, Hades is painted blue on a throne and holds a figure in his bosom. His beard is given as white, emphasizing his age. Two angels are pushing sinners towards him. In the London ivory, similar to the Torcello wall mosaic, Hades holds a figure in his bosom and is depicted on a throne. In both pictures, the beast Hades sits on has disappeared, instead, there is a throne with heads coming out of it. As a matter of fact, in both portrayals, it appears that the described heads can be seen in the mouth of the beast sitting next to the throne.



**Figure 14:** *The Last Judgement, Gülşehir Karşı Church, Hell and Heaven, 1212, mural painting (Peker, 2008, Plate 27, 30).*

Many examples of the scene can be seen in Anatolia. Cappadocia is very rich in this respect. One of the buildings where the scene is seen is the Gülşehir Karşı Church. The Last Judgment scene in the church begins on the northern part of the west wall with the theme of the Weighing of Souls.



**Figure 15:** *The Last Judgement, Gülşehir Karşı Church, Hell and Heaven, 1212, mural painting (Peker, 2008, Plate 27, 30).*

The Heaven theme of the scene is located on the north wall and occupies the entire lower lane of the vault. In the southern part of the west wall, the theme of Hell appears as Punishment for Sinners, Sinners being taken to Hell by angels, Satan pulling the Clergy to Hell, and the False

Prophet. Mary, the Good Thief, Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob are included in the depiction of Heaven (Figure 14-15) (Peker, 2008, p. 61-62).

In monumental paintings, the themes of the Last Judgment scene are depicted on different parts of the walls. This can be observed in many wall paintings. Despite everything, the themes are portrayed close to each other in the churches. We can see the same structure in this church. While Hell takes part on the west wall of the naos, Heaven is depicted on the north wall. The Good Thief, Mary, Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob are pictured side by side. Peker mentions that the coexistence of three prophets in all Heaven positions in the region makes the region different on its own (Peker, 2008, p. 123). In scenes, the three prophets are carrying souls in their bosoms.

## Conclusion

According to Christian theology, Jesus will return to earth and judge all humanity. Apocalyptic texts, the Old and New Testaments, various sermons and the writings of many clergies have influenced the formation of this idea. The Byzantines interpreted what kind of judgment would be at the end of the world within the framework of Christianity. They believed that divine justice ultimately prevailed at the end of events. Jesus will perform the judgment of all mankind on that day. This is actually the price of the penance he paid.

While transferring the last judgment theme of the Byzantine artists to the paintings, they used much data related to this judgment. In the Last Judgment scenes, the depictions of Heaven depicted to the right of Jesus are seen in the two areas of the Chosen and Abraham's Bosom. When we look at the scenes, it is clear that there is a hierarchy between these two regions. The Chosen are always located above the Paradise Garden, where Abraham's Bosom is located in the Last Judgment scenes. Here, both the hierarchy and the waiting area are clearly conveyed. Whilst the bishops are now described as deserving of permanent paradise, the Paradise Garden and Abraham's Bosom are depicted as the place of those who wait.

The painters clearly express the symmetrical position between Heaven and Hell in the Last Judgment scenes. While the Paradise Garden is very clearly reconciled to the tortured area of the damned, the Chosen are associated with the location of the Lake of Fire. The symmetrical positions between the scenes indicate that attention is drawn to the connection between Heaven and Hell. In addition, by doing this, the artists, aimed to show the wards and punishments to the audience. It is expressly seen in the paintings that there is a connection between Abraham and Hades's Bosom in the Last Judgment scenes. In the Last Judgment scenes, Abraham's Bosom and the Paradise Garden are to the right of Jesus, whilst Hades's Bosom is to his left. By using these two pictures, the artists sharply reflected the understanding of two Heavens and two Hells in the scene. This is plainly seen with the Chosen above Abraham's Bosom, and the hellish dwellings below the area where Hades's Bosom is located. However, the most important difference between the two scenes is that one is the intermediate form before salvation and the other is where the eternal Hell is depicted.

One of the most crucial similarities between the two paintings is that they both have a child figure on their bosom. This condition shows the mutual interaction between the two scenes. At this point, while the child figure in Abraham's Bosom represents good spirits and Lazarus, the figure in Hades's Bosom symbolizes evil spirits. Artists interpreted the same figures in two different themes in the Last Judgment scenes.

While the Last Judgment scene is depicted on the church walls, the themes are scattered to different parts of the building. Whilst this scene was depicted on the naos and vaults of churches in the 10th century, it was staged on the narthex walls in the 11th century. This understanding can be seen intensely in the last period of Byzantine. The Last Judgment scene taken into the narthex first focused the audience on this issue. This situation can be explained by the political structure of the period. The attacks of the Turks especially had many effects on Byzantine art. The Last Judgment scenes were made in the narthexes, and the idea that Jesus would come soon and save the Christians created a connotation in people's minds. At one point, the artists completed the impending end of the state with the Second Coming of Jesus.

## Conflict of interest declaration

"The Connection between Abraham and Hades's Bosom in the Context of the Last Judgment Scene" başlıklı makalemin herhangi bir kurum, kuruluş, kişi ile mali çıkar çatışması yoktur.

## Bibliography

- Angheben, M. (2002). Les Jugements derniers Byzantins des XIe-XIIe Siècles et L'iconographie du Jugement Immédiat. In *Cahiers archéologiques* 50, 105-134
- Angheben, M. (2015). Le Jugement dernier de Fossa: Une vision eschatologique intégrant la représentation du jugement immédiat. In *Hortus Artium Medievalium* 21. (pp. 406-420). Brepols Publishers.
- Bailey, K. E. (2003). *Jacob & the Prodigal: How Jesus retold Israel's story*. Illinois: InterVarsity Press.
- Brenk, B. (1966). *Tradition und Neuerung in der christlichen Kunst des ersten Jahrtausends: Studien zur Geschichte des Weltgerichtsbildes*. Vienna: Böhlau.
- Brown, P. (2017). *Geç Antikçağ dünyası* (Translated by T. Kaçar). Istanbul: ALFA.
- Caridad, E. C. (2017). *El juicio final en textos litúrgicos medievales*. *Vegueta* 17. Universidad de Las Palmas de Gran Canaria.
- Cavarnos, C. (1993). *Guide to Byzantine Iconography*. Vol. 1. Boston.
- Chookaszian, L. (2011). On the Full Page Illustrations of the "Last Judgement" in the Art Armenian Miniaturist of 13th Century Toros Roslin. (V. A. Briskina-Müller, A. Drost-Abgarjan and A. Meißner, Ed.). In *Logos im Dialogos Auf der Suche nach der Orthodoxie: Gedenkschrift für Hermann Goltz (1946-2010)* (*Forum Orthodoxe Theologie*). Berlin: LIT Verlag.
- Grabar, A. (1968). *Christian Iconography a Study of Its Origins*. New Jersey: Princeton University.
- Herrmann, J., & Van Den Hoek, A. (2009). Apocalyptic themes in the monumental and minor art of early christianity. R. J. Daly (Ed.), In *apocalyptic thought in early christianity*. (pp. 33-80). Baker Academic.
- Jensen, R. M. (2000). *Understanding early christian art*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Kartsonis, A. D. (1986). *Anastasis: The making of an image*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.
- Maguire, H. (2018). Why did Hades become beautiful in Byzantine art?. G. Ekroth and I. Nilsson (Ed.), In *Round Trip to Hades in the Eastern Mediterranean Tradition: Visits to the Underworld from Antiquity to Byzantium*. (pp. 304-321). Leiden: Brill.
- Marinis, V. (2017). *Death and afterlife in Byzantium: The fate of the soul in theology, liturgy, and art*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Meyendorff, J. (1974). *St. Gregory Palamas and orthodox spirituality*. (Translated by A. Fiske). New York: St Vladimir's Seminary Press.
- Meyer, M. (2016). Hiding in Plain Sight: The Second Coming and the Last Judgment in the Vatican Psalter, gr. 752. In *Cahiers archéologiques* 56, 71-86.
- Morgan, A. (2019, December 10). *The Last Judgment in Christian Iconography: Public lecture given in the University of Cambridge, 1987*. <https://www.alisonmorgan.co.uk/>
- Mouriki, D. (1976). An Unusual Representation of the Last Judgement in a Thirteenth Century Fresco at St. George near Kouvaras in Attica (πίν. 70-93). In *Δελτίον ΧΑΕ* 8 (1975-1976), *Περίοδος Δ'. Στη μνήμη του Βίκτωρα Λάζαρεφ (1897-1976)*. (pp. 145-172). Αθήνα.

- Nilsson, I. (2018). Hades Meets Lazarus: The Literary Katabasis in Twelfth-Century Byzantium. G. Ekroth and I. Nilsson (Ed.), In *Round Trip to Hades in the Eastern Mediterranean Tradition: Visits to the Underworld from Antiquity to Byzantium*. (pp. 322-341). Leiden: Brill.
- Peker, N. (2008). *Kapadokya Bölgesi Bizans Dönemi Kiliselerinde Son Mahkeme Sahneleri*. [Unpublished doctoral dissertation]. Hacettepe University: Social Sciences Institute.
- Romanos Melodist. (1970). On the Resurrection II. P. L. Piana and A. Bellinger (Ed.), In *Kontakia of Romanos, Byzantine Melodist I: On the Person of Christ*. (Translated by M. Carpenter). Columbia: University of Missouri Press.
- Vikan, G. (Ed.). (1973). *Illuminated Greek Manuscripts from American Collections: An Exhibition in Honor of Kurt Weitzmann*. Princeton University.
- Weitzmann, K. (1971). *Studies in Classical and Byzantine Manuscript Illumination*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.
- Wortley, J. (2001). Death, Judgment, Heaven, and Hell in Byzantine "Beneficial Tales". A. M. Talbot (Ed.), In *Dumbarton Oaks Paper*. Vol. 55. (pp. 53-69). Washington, D.C.: Dumbarton Oaks Research Library and Collection.

### Genişletilmiş Özet

Hıristiyanlığın en önemli konularından biri de Son Yargı'dır. Hıristiyanlar bir noktada bu durumu İsa'nın çektiği çile çerçevesinde insanlığın ödeyeceği bir kefarete olarak görmüştür. Bu süreçte İsa tekrardan dünyaya gelip bütün insanlığı yargılayacaktır. Bu fikrin oluşmasında Eski ve Yeni Ahit dışındaki birçok dini metin etkili olmuştur. Kilise Babalarının görüşleri, apokaliptik metinler, patristik geleneğin ortaya koyduğu fikirler bu dinsel anlayışın genişlemesinin başında gelmektedir. Bizanslı sanatçılar bu çerçevede ortaya koyulan düşüncelerle ilgili konu hakkında birçok sanat eseri üretmiştir. Onlar sahneyi duvar resimlerine, el yazmalarına, fildişi oymalara ikonlara resmetmiştir.

Son Yargı çerçevesinde en önemli iki tema arasında İbrahim ve Hades'in Kucağı gelmektedir. Bu iki tema aslında evrensel bir yargılama biçiminin en güzel örneklerini yansıtmaktadır. Son Yargı sahnesinde İlahi mahkeme, kurtuluşa erenler ve ceza çekenlerin bulunduğu üç ana yapı içerisinde İbrahim'in Kucağı İsa'nın sağında kurtuluşa erenlerin, Hades'in Kucağı İsa'nın solunda ceza çekeceklerin alanı içerisinde yerini almıştır. İki sahne arasında sanatçılar birçok bağlantı kurmuş ve izleyiciye tam anlamıyla bunu vermiştir. Sanatçılar bu temaları kullanarak ölümden sonraki yaşamda nelerin yaşanacağı durumuyla alakalı insanların zihinlerinde olayı yaşatmışlardır.

Son Yargı sahnelerinde en önemli kavram cennet ve cehennemdir. Dikkatli bir şekilde incelendiğinde sahnede iki cennet ve iki cehennemin varlığı net bir şekilde görülmektedir. İlahi Mahkemenin sağında hemen alt sicimde Seçilmişlerin bulunduğu sonsuz kurtuluş, solunda ise sonsuz ateş ve Hades'in Kucağı yer almaktadır. Bu sahnelerin altında sağda Cennet Bahçesi ve ara form niteliği taşıyan İbrahim'in Kucağı, solda ise Cehennem konutları görülmektedir. Buradan izleyiciye hem kurtuluş alanında kimlerin bulunacağı hem de sonsuz ateşte ve Hades'te yanacaklar net bir şekilde sanatçılar tarafından anlatılmıştır.

Son Yargı sahnesi resimlere yansıtılırken İbrahim'in Kucağı ara bir form olarak düşünülmüşken Hades'in Kucağı sonsuz cehennemin yeri olarak tasarlanmıştır. Sanatçılar iki tema arasında birçok geçiş yapıyı kullanmışlardır. Bunlar arasında en önemlilerinden biri iki temada bulunan çocuk figürüdür. İbrahim'in Kucağı'nda bulunan çocuk figürleri ve Lazarus iyi ruhları, Hades'in Kucağı'ndaki çocuk figürü kötü ruhları temsil etmektedir. Hades'in Kucağı'ndaki çocuk figürünün kimliği ise belirsizdir. Temalar arasındaki en önemli unsurlardan bir diğeri zengin adamdır. Lazarus'un Cennet Bahçesi'nde yer alması ile zengin adamın sonsuz ateşte bulunması iki tema arasındaki benzeştirme çabalarının en güzel örneğidir. İki figürün farklı alanlarda bulunması temalar arasındaki zıtlığı pekiştirmektedir.

Temaların Son Yargı sahnelerinde yerleştiriliş biçimindeki hiyerarşi oldukça iyi bir şekilde yansıtılmaktadır. Bu durum özellikle el yazmalarında net olarak görülmektedir. Sahne içerisinde yer alan temalar yukarıdan aşağı doğru verilerek hiyerarşinin açıklanmasında önemli bir veri olarak karşımıza çıkmaktadır. Bu noktada İlahi Mahkeme alanı diğer alanlardan açık bir şekilde ayrılmıştır. Sahne duvarlara resmedilirken yapı içerisinde birçok alana dağılmıştır. Ancak sanatçılar her şeye rağmen hiyerarşik düzeni terk etmemişlerdir. Sahnenin hiyerarşik ve bir bütün olarak ele alındığı en önemli örnek Torcello duvar mozağidir. Yapıda bütün temalar açık bir şekilde görülmektedir. Bunun dışında Kapadokya duvar resimlerinde İbrahim'in Kucağı farklı bir yaklaşım sergilemektedir. Buradaki Son Yargı sahnelerine İshak ve Yakup'un girmesi bölgeyi başlı başına ayırmaktadır. Bu noktada Son Yargı sahneleri ilk dönemlerde naosa ve kilisenin çeşitli yerlerine yapılırken Bizans'ın son dönemlerinde nartekse alınmıştır. Sahnenin nartekse taşınması dönemin politik olaylarından kaynaklanmaktadır. Türklerin yaptığı saldırılar bunun başında gelmektedir. Nartekse çekilen sahne ile içeriye giren kişilere devletin yaklaşım sonunu gösterilmeye çalışılmıştır. Bir noktada yaklaşım son ile Son Yargı sahnesi bağdaştırılıp dinsel yaklaşımın daha kuvvetli olması sağlanmıştır.